

## Appendix B – Route Appraisal Table

		2007 Feasibility Report	Scheme Termination	Holme Lacy Road Improvements	Welsh Water Bridge – Current Approved Route	New Bridge – Preferred Route
Section1	City Link	Not included in report		13,000	17,500	17,500
Section 2	Footpath HER18 Improvements	72,000		N/A	N/A	N/A
	Holme Lacy Rd improvements	N/A		350,000 (nominal figure as design not commenced or costed)	N/A	N/A
	Outfall Works Rd Improvements	N/A		N/A	50,000	N/A
	Eign Road Improvements	N/A		N/A	N/A	150,000
	West/North River Approach	57,800		N/A	285,000	100,000
	Ramps / River Bridge	500,000		N/A	850,000	1,300,000
	East/South River Approach / Railway Underpass	125,500		N/A	206,000	80,000
	Section 2 Total	755,300		350,000	1,391,000	1,630,000
Section 3	Rotherwas Link	384,000		132,000	132,000	132,000
Section 4	Holme Lacy Link	756,240		756,240	756,240	756,240
<b>Total Construction Cost</b>		<b>1,895,540</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1,251,240</b>	<b>2,296,740</b>	<b>2,535,740</b>
Land Acquisition / Compensation		Not included in report		Not Included	£190,000 (worst case scenario)	£215,000 (worst case scenario)
Consultants Design Fees		Not included In report 150,000	Spend to Date	200,000	282,000	400,000
Construction Supervision Fees		Not included in report 100,000		100,000	200,000	200,000
<b>Total Scheme Cost (£)</b>		<b>2,145,540</b>	<b>Spend to Date</b>	<b>1,551,240</b>	<b>2,968,740</b>	<b>3,350,740</b>
<b>External Funding Available</b>		<b>350,000</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>350,000 (Connect2 - Big Lottery) 756,240 (Sustrans - Links to School)</b>	<b>350,000 (Connect2 - Big Lottery) 756,240 (Sustrans - Links to School)</b>
<b>Herefordshire Council Liability</b>		<b>1,795,540</b>	<b>Spend to Date</b>	<b>1,551,240</b>	<b>1,862,500</b>	<b>2,244,500</b>
<b>Current Capital Allocation</b>		<b>1,400,650</b>		<b>1,400,650</b>	<b>1,400,650</b>	<b>1,400,650</b>
<b>Capital Allocation Shortfall</b>		<b>394,890</b>		<b>150,590</b>	<b>461,850</b>	<b>843,850</b>
<b>Cost Profile**</b>						
<b>2008/9/10</b>		693,550	Spend to Date	200,000	282,000	200,000
<b>2010/11</b>		353,550		900,000	905,740	1,105,740
<b>2011/12</b>		353,550			1,746,225	2,006,750
<b>2012/13</b>		743,550			34,775	38,250
<b>Programme Bridge Opening</b>		Not Given	Not Applicable	August 2010	February 2011	November 2011

	2007 Feasibility Report	Scheme Termination	Holme Lacy Road Improvements	Welsh Water Bridge – Current Approved Route	New Bridge – Preferred Route
<b>Design / Construction</b>	Assumes the route avoids HGVs on outfall works road by using and upgrading footpath HER18. Highlights riverside protection works necessary or additional land from Welsh Water. Includes parapet upgrade requirement. Includes overhead electricity cable diversion.	Not Applicable	Major improvements required to Holme Lacy Road to focus upon the narrow road through the railway bridge. Improvements required to the shared footway cycleway. Junction improvements to reduce crossing distances. (See Holme Lacy Road Improvement Scheme Scoping Report from June 2007 prepared by Amey)	Existing bridge will require costly inspection and design check process which still has the potential to preclude its use. Inspection works may require significant temporary works with effects not yet quantified on the project costs and programme. Land access on both sides of the river difficult to achieve due to the railway line, river, housing and Welsh Water plant. Costly diversion (approximately £70,000 to £80,000) of overhead electricity cable. Railway possessions are likely to be required to facilitate plant and materials deliveries east of the river.	Bridge designed by tendered delivery consortium. Land access good to both sides of the river assuming landowner compliance. Minimal / No Statutory Undertakers diversion necessary (local supplies on Eign Road may be effected). No need to undertake costly overhead electricity cable diversion.
<b>Environmental</b>	States that the reuse of the Welsh Water bridge has a reduced environmental impact than a new bridge. This is now known no longer to be the case.	Not Applicable	Minimal Environmental Impact for Holme Lacy Road Section of the route.	Major Site Clearance and removal of mature trees. Short term impact on Bat foraging corridor and roosting sites. Extensive works adjacent to long length of River Wye which has SSSI designation and European SAC designation. Known badger sett to be closed. Development requiring a full Environmental Statement for Planning. Extensive riverbank requirement within Active Floodplain.	Less Site Clearance but still requires removal of mature trees. Short term impact of potential bat roosting site. Much Less Extensive works adjacent to River Wye which has SSSI designation and European SAC designation. No known Badger Activity. Potential Otter Activity. Development requiring a full Environmental Statement for Planning with additional requirement for impact on visual amenity.
<b>Health and Safety</b>	Concerns raised about HGVs on Outfall Works Road and around the sewage plant entrance. Overhead Cable proximity highlighted.	Not Applicable	Working adjacent to live carriageway.	15 pier foundation excavations directly adjacent to river. New parapet fixing necessary above the river. Risk to the public/ Exceptions to Safety Audit where no footpath exists and also along Outfall Works Road.	2 pier foundation excavations directly adjacent to river. Parapets prefabricated on superstructure to minimise working at height. Reduced risks of Outfall Works Road, although some risk on Eign Road.
<b>Planning</b>	No Comments	Not Applicable	Requires formal screening opinion but may not require formal planning permission.	Risk to planning due to environmental impact of scheme. Adoption of the route not possible.	Risks to planning due to possible objection from limited number of residential properties adjacent to bridge site. Adoption of route as a public highway a strong possibility.
<b>Land</b>	Welsh Water concerns about security highlighted.	Not Applicable	No additional land required for the Holme Lacy Road section of the route.	Six Separate Landowners requiring separate agreements for the route from the City Centre to Sink Green. All liaison has commenced.	Three landowners effected requiring agreements for the route from the City Centre to Sink Green. Limited liaison regarding this option to date with one landowner indicating some support.
<b>Public Engagement</b>	No Comments	Major adverse reaction likely through steering group and wider public.	Adverse reaction likely through steering group and wider public. Little amenity benefit provided for leisure users. Loss of Connect2 branding and support from Sustrans / Big Lottery.	Currently designs not well received by the steering group. Some amenity benefit for leisure users. Continued Connect2 branding and support from Sustrans and Big Lottery. Reduced journey time for cyclists North of the River and for pedestrians and cyclists to the east of the city centre accessing the estate, Holme Lacy and countryside amenities.	Greater support expected from steering group. Wider public support also expected. High amenity benefit for leisure users. Continued Connect2 branding and support from Sustrans and Big Lottery. Best desire line with greatest reduction in journey time for cyclists North of the River and for pedestrians and cyclists to the east of the city centre accessing the estate, Holme Lacy and countryside amenities. Most improvement to route safety, comfort, amenity and therefore greatest likely use with maximum shift from car use.
<b>Maintenance / Whole life</b>	No Comments	Not Applicable	If signalised narrowing is provided at the railway bridge then there will be an ongoing maintenance cost	Structure from the 1970s so potentially shorter residual life which cannot be determined before inspections are complete. Ongoing inspection and maintenance cost similar for all options. Current liaison suggests that the agreement for the use of the bridge could be terminated by Welsh Water at any time.	New bridge with full design life (125 years) wholly owned and maintained by the council. Ongoing inspection and maintenance cost similar for all options.